

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, July 21, 2015

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Ben Goodman Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp (arrived 6:15 p.m., Agenda Item #1)
Charmaine Sutton

Commissioners Absent: Todd Boyer, Jason Sudy

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:10 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, August 11, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, August 18, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, June 16, 2015.
MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (3-0-1 [Goodman]) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record.
Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-7-9

825 North Fourth Street

Bruce Sommerfelt/Signcom (Applicant)

Highland Real Estate (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-7-9, 825 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Signage

- Move the existing address number “825” to the existing brick column, per the submitted rendering.
- Install one (1) new, non-illuminated, wall sign, per the submitted drawings and photoshop rendering.
- New sign to include custom cut-out, ¼” thick plate aluminum with lettering routed through, per the submitted drawing (total – 9.9 sq. ft.).
- Sign to be painted “Matthews acrylic polyurethane, Dark Duranodic Bronze.
- Sign to be mounted to brick wall using ¾” x 1” standoffs.
- All fasteners to be placed in mortar rather than in the face of the brick.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (3-1[Goodman]-1[Lapp]) APPROVED

2. 15-7-10

146-148 East Fourth Avenue

Rob Dorans & Brent Duncan (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, the request for corrugated metal roofing was withdrawn by the Applicant and changed to a request for roofing from the approved roofing shingle list. A motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-7-10, 146-148 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

☐ CertainTeed

☐ GAF

☐ Certain Teed

☐ GAF

☐ Owens Corning

☐ Tamko

Style:

Carriage House (dimensional)

Slateline (dimensional)

(standard 3-tab)

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

Color:

☐ Stonegate Gray

☐ English Gray Slate

☐ Weathered Slate

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ Estate Gray

☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (5-0-0) APPROVED

3. 15-7-11

375 East Fifth Avenue

Ascent Roofing Solutions, LLC (Applicant)

Clark Grave Vault, Co. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-7-11, 375 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the sloped sections of the roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code. Re-roofing to be phased over the next two years.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Install new Certain Teed, Hatteras, asphalt shingles. Color to be "Hunter Green" or "Georgetown Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Note: The Hatteras shingle is being approved as a test case for this property based on its location and industrial use. The "Hunter Green" color is being approved based on the long history of green asphalt shingles at this property.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

4. 15-7-12

67 & 69 East First Avenue

Melinda Talbot [67] & Maurice Madry [69] (Applicants/Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 15-7-12, 67 & 69 East First Avenue, to allow the Applicant time to submit a drawing for a new retaining wall and/or plantings and sidewalks, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (5-0-0) CONTINUED

5. 15-7-13

919 North Fourth Street

Chad Seiber (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 15-7-13, 919 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Landscape Plan

- Install new landscape/hardscape in the front and rear yard.
- Dry stacked walls to be 18" high, "Indiana limestone" or "Ottawa Rustic."
- Install new, wood, platform deck extension of the rear porch, per the submitted drawings.
- Revised drawing, including a reduction in the depth of the front planting bed, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

HOLDOVERS

6. 15-4-20c

936 North Fourth Street

Nick Gore (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of the Applicant, and based on the Italian Village Commission policy to remove an application from the agenda following three (3) consecutive absences by the Applicant, remove Application #15-4-20c, 936 North Fourth Street from the agenda and from further consideration. Submittal of a new application is required to be placed on a future agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

7. 15-4-29

1044 North High Street

Brian Swanson (Applicant)

Fred Maloof (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of the Applicant, and based on the Italian Village Commission policy to remove an application from the agenda following three (3) consecutive absences by the Applicant, remove Application #15-4-29, 1044 North High Street from the agenda and from further consideration. Submittal of a new application is required to be placed on a future agenda.

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (5-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

8. 15-4-32b

920 North High Street

Sketch Blue on behalf of Donatos (Applicant)

Emerald Light Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-4-32b, Commissioner Hagerling noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Commissioner Cooke assumed the role of Chairperson.

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-4-32b, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Painted Vertical Logotype/West Elevation/Donatos

- “Cream” color logotype to be painted directly onto black brick, per the submitted “Original” rendering.
- Sign to have “distressed” appearance, per the submitted sample board.
- Placement to be coordinated with installation of any building lighting and window mullions to ensure proper alignment.

Drive-Thru/Wall Graphics/East Elevation/Donatos

- Install laser cut, brick grip, vinyl graphics, applied directly to exterior wall surface, per the submitted renderings and sample board.
- Graphics to read “PIZZA LOVE – CRAVEABLE – COMMUNITY – 1963.”

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (3-1 [Hagerling]-1 [Goodman]) APPROVED

9. 15-6-18

812 Summit Street (formerly 808)

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Marion Risberg (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-4-32b, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction - Lot One/North

- Construct a new, two-unit residence and a new, coach house residence, per the submitted site plan and discussion at the July 21, 2015 IVC hearing.
- Siding to be HardiePlank, smooth clapboard, 4" exposure.
- Simple trim belt course and porch fascia and soffit to be Certain Teed "Smart-Tim."
- Cut sheet for aluminum-clad, wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- East and west elevation entrance doors to be Therma-Tru, fiberglass, three-quarter-lite doors. Stain color to be submitted.
- North elevation entrance doors to be Therma-Tru, fiberglass, half-lite two-panel doors. Stain color to be submitted.
- Foundation to be brick formed concrete cast walls.
- Porch columns to be smooth, cedar column wraps. Revised drawing for porch column/entablature to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by Commissioner Cooke, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Paint color to be submitted.
- Roofing to be from the approved roofing shingles list.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (3-2 [Hagerling – Sutton]-0) APPROVED

10. 15-6-15a

898 Hamlet Street

Allan Hurtt (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-6-15a, 898 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, one-story, frame addition.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, frame addition, per the submitted site plan. Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Siding to be cementitious siding.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood (addition only).
- Cut sheets for new windows, doors, and exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Windows & Door/Existing Dwelling

- Repair/ replace existing, wood, two-over-two, double-hung sash windows on the existing house, as noted per the Historic Preservation Office staff June 3, 2015 site visit. Non-deteriorated windows will be retained and repaired, as needed.
- Install new, all wood (interior/exterior) two-over-two, double-hung sash windows. Cut sheets for all new windows and doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Goodman/Sutton (4-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED

11. 15-5-22b

995 North Fourth Street

Brad Parish/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-5-22b, 995 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

West Parking Lot

- Pave area west of the buildings, to provide 39 parking spaces, per the submitted site plan.
- Brick pavers to be used for parking stall areas.
- Asphalt to be used for drive aisle.
- Remove existing chain-link fence, and install new, black, aluminum fence and landscaping, per the submitted site plan. Non-deciduous shrub species at fence line to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Caliper of shade trees to be no less than 2 ½ ". Ornamental trees to no less than 2-inches.
- Install new trash enclosure, per the submitted site plan.
- Revised site plan to be submitted to

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) APPROVED

12. 15-6-25

1171-1175 Summit Street

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Burwell Investments, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #15-6-25, 1171-1175 Summit Street, for installation of new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Lapp/Cook (5-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

13. 15-7-14

1126, 1130 Say Ave. & 77 East Fourth Ave.

New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-14, 1126, 1130 Say Ave. & 77 East Fourth Ave., for a new retaining wall, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Cook/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED

14. 15-7-15

1000 North High Street

Jordan Neff-Estle/RED Architecture for Chipotle Grill (Applicant)

Elford Development (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-7-15, 1000 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Outdoor Seating

- Install new, 288 sq. ft. outdoor seating area along the west/front and south elevations of Chipotle.
- Seating to include seven (7) 24" round tables with two (2) chairs each, and one (1) 38" x 24" ADA table with two (2) chairs, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheets.
- One (1) trash receptacle to be at the southeast corner of the seating area.

- This approval is for the current tenant (Chipotle) only. Any future tenant is to return for review and approval of any outdoor seating area.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED

15. 15-7-16

842 North Fourth Street/Jeffrey Park Community Center

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-16, 842 North Fourth Street/Jeffrey Park Community Center, to allow the Applicant time to install a test window with the Zippy Grid Storefront Grid System, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED

16. 15-7-17

268, 270 & 272 Neruda Avenue

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-17, 268, 270 & 272 Neruda Avenue, to allow the Applicants time to submit revised drawings, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (5-0-0) CONTINUED

17. 15-7-18

1174 North High Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Thomas Smith (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-18, 1174 North High Street, to allow the Applicants time to submit revised drawings, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

- Consider using stucco rather than HardiPlank siding.
- Consider changing the windows to a more horizontal, industrial type window.
- Consider replacing the existing rear doors.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED

18. 15-7-19

1023 North Sixth Street

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Jennifer McGann (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-7-19, 1023 North Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Enclose Open-Walled Garage

- Enclose the open, east elevation of the existing, concrete block building, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Windows to be Marvin, aluminum-clad, wood awning and four-lite simulated divided lite windows.
- Pedestrian doors to be flush, insulated steel doors.
- East elevation overhead garage doors to be 12' x 8' Stratford, flush, insulated steel doors with two lites, per the submitted cut sheet.
- South elevation overhead garage door to be 18' x 8' Stratford, flush, insulated steel doors, per the submitted cut sheet.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (5-0-0) APPROVED

19. 15-6-16

930 & 940 North High Street

H. Christopher Friend/Schooley Caldwell Assoc. (Applicant) The Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-6-16, 930 & 940 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new six (6) story, brick and stone, mixed use building, per the submitted drawings and materials schedule and samples.
- Color and size samples of the brick for the three stories above the façade storefront to return for final review and approval at a future Italian Village Commission hearing.
- First floor to be retail space fronting High Street.
- Second floor to be office space.
- Floors three through five to include ten (1) residential units each.
- The set back sixth floor to include two (2) penthouse suites and a clubhouse with rooftop terrace.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood. Cut sheet for windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Entrance storefronts to be painted, tubular aluminum storefront systems with anodized aluminum doors, with medium stiles.
- Sills and lintels (solid, not split) to be cast stone on the façade and cast concrete on the east, west and south.

MOTION: Lapp/Cook (5-0-0) APPROVED

20. 15-7-20

163-177 Punta Alley

Michelle & Jeff Mixter (Applicants)

Multiple Owners

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-20, 163-177 Punta Alley, to allow the Applicants time to submit a landscape plan, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 18, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

21. 15-7-21

165 Punta Alley

Michelle & Jeff Mixter (Applicants/Owners)

New Addition

- Construct a new addition above the existing, rear, shed-roof porch, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be wood board and batten or wood lap siding.
- Existing wood windows to be relocated from the rear of the shed-roof porch to the new addition.
- Roof shingles to match existing as closely as possible.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks a difference in the height of the new and existing roofs is more appropriate, so there is a visible difference between the old and new.
- Would like more information regarding the use of overhangs in Italian Village.

Rex Hagerling:

- Need more detail to understand the rear overhang/cantilever. Conceptually, it could be fine, if done well.
- Is not concerned about the arrangement of doors and windows in the back, but concerned about how the posts would be detailed.
- Also prefers the roof that steps down.
- Thinks the siding should not be horizontal, not board-and-batten.

David Cooke:

- Agrees with comments of Commissioner Hagerling.
- Thinks the siding for the addition should be horizontal at a different scale than the original, not board-and-batten.

Ben Goodman:

- Agrees that the step down in the roof line is the better option.
- If the rear posts work into a porch detail, it could be more appropriate; perhaps a closed in porch. Need to see more details.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Could see the rear overhang as a vestibule or porch.

NO ACTION TAKEN

22. 15-7-22

800 North High Street

Paul & Justin Liu (Applicants)

Paul Liu (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a new, six-story, mixed-use building on the current parking lot, per the submitted drawings.
- New building to include retail and restaurant spaces and residential tenant parking at ground level; general office space on floors two through four, and twelve residential units on floors five and six.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Would like to see the Parkside on Pearl building included in future renderings to provide scale and context.
- Consider changing the façade from a single plane in order to reduce the mass on High Street a bit.
- If balconies are being introduced, they may be better placed on the south than on the north.

David Cooke:

- Appreciates the background story presented by the architect.
- The Commission needs to consider the long term impact of the building.
- Strongly encourages moving the curb cut from Hubbard Avenue to the alley.
- Suggests removing the large retail sign letters from renderings during the review process to avoid any misunderstandings until the actual signage is proposed.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Appreciates the design process that was used to develop the concept.
- Has concerns about windows on the south side of the building at a point when the Haiku and La Fogata buildings are no longer standing.

Ben Goodman:

- Agrees that the curb cut needs to be moved from Hubbard Avenue to the alley.
- Is in favor of more office space. The amount of office space could affect the view of how many floors would be appropriate. Still needs to think about the height.
- Thinks the way the façade is divided with a certain mass dropping down, and another mass popping up, is kind of elegant. Thinks it gets kind of muddled when it turns the corner. The purity of the cube is sort of lost with the projecting awning. Thinks it breaks down a bit moving east from the west elevation.
- Needs a better understanding of the open air windows on the corner.
- Consider shifting the masses, with the lower section and a bit more lightness toward Hubbard Avenue.

Rex Hagerling:

- Not in favor of having only 12 parking spaces inside the building.
- Not in favor of depending on the Hubbard garage for parking for this or future buildings. The garage should be available for the public.
- Would like to see the Hub building and garage included in future renderings to provide scale and context.

NO ACTION TAKEN

23. 15-7-23

22 Prescott Street

Prescott & Pearl, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-23, 22 Prescott Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Landscape Plan

- Install new landscaping, per the submitted site plan.

Note: The Commission recommends including planter containers at the southwest corner.

Exterior Lighting

- Install new exterior lighting, per the submitted elevation drawings and product cut sheets.

Note: The Commission recommends repositioning the address number (22) to provide the best site line and maximum exposure.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED

24. 15-7-24

NW crnr. First Ave. & Mt. Pleasant Ave. (formerly 32-36 E. First Ave.) & 921 Mt. Pleasant Ave.

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

New Construction

- First conceptual review for construction of two (2) new, two-story, brick townhomes facing onto First Avenue, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Construct new, four-car garage with two (2) residential units above.
- Construct a new one-car garage addition with terrace above, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Hagerling called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Dan Morgan 946 Mt. Pleasant Ave. Neighboring property owner Self	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Strongly opposes the large curb cut along Mt. Pleasant Ave. Noted that 921 Mt. Pleasant already has a curb cut and another for the alley.• Mt. Pleasant Ave. should not be treated like it is an alley/secondary street.• Concerns for the young children on the block.• Wants to preserve the pedestrian quality of the neighborhood.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Not against developing the site, but thinks the project should show more kindness to the neighborhood.
--	--

Following the public speaker, and presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Thinks some of the details of the main building are elegant and charming, but don't fit the character of the village.
- Look further at the proportions of the windows and doors.
- Thinks the top section of the carriage house feels positive in the relationship of fitting into the neighborhood, but does not think the base is the appropriate design or proportion.
- A new garage for 921 is fine, but is not in favor of a terrace on top of the garage or of the exterior staircase. It is not typical for the neighborhood.
- Would not support a second sidewalk parallel to the First Street sidewalk.

Rex Hagerling:

- Would like to see drawings/renderings of the rear/north elevation of the brick building. Would be helpful to include the building next door (west) in the renderings. Will want to see a height comparison.
- Would need to see more details of any proposed cornice/fascia/brackets, etc.
- Thinks stone sills would be more appropriate than brick. Would need to be solid sills, not split sills.
- Consider a brick base for the carriage house with frame above. Doesn't think the blank wall on the east elevation is working well.
- Still has concerns about the proposed size of the curb cut on Mt. Pleasant Avenue. Thinks two smaller ones would be better than one giant one.
- Need to consider the view of the carriage house elevations when approaching from the north or from the south.
- Thinks the proportions of the windows are generally good.
- Has concerns with considering an attached garage. Would have to be done very carefully.

Charmaine Sutton:

- In general agreement with Commissioner Cooke and Hagerling.
- In an effort to shrink down the curb cut further, could the 921 garage be turned, possibly attached to the house?
- Would prefer to see a driveway and parking area/auto court shared by the two properties. Would not like to see a driveway for 921 Mt. Pleasant with cars parked on the apron.

Ben Goodman:

- Thinks the scale, high pitched roof, and details of the main building presents somewhat like a school.
- It is a handsome resolution and has some nice rhythm, but concerned about the scale fitting into the neighborhood.
- Has some concerns about using three windows on a façade, as two windows is more typical in Italian Village.
- Is an advocate for basements.
- Would like to see the curb cut reduced further.

Josh Lapp:

- Perhaps adding a door and awning on the first floor of the carriage house could help it address the street better.
- Thinks a terrace above the 921 garage could work if done in the right way.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

- **15-7-1**

69 East Fourth Avenue

Robert Saultz (Applicant)

Mary Saultz (Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-1, 69 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Tree Removal

- Remove the dead tree, located in the rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Tree removal to be done in accordance with standard industry practices to insure the safety of all neighboring properties and any/all workers involved.
- Remove the stump below grade to prevent new growth
- Haul away all debris.
- A new tree is to be planted within the same general area as the tree that has been removed.
- The species of the new tree to be chosen by Applicant.

- **15-7-2**

1001-1003 Summit Street

Brian Grim (Applicant)

Italian Village Columbus, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-2, 1001-1003 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Asphalt Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated asphalt shingles on the roof of the house with new shingles to match existing, as needed, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new flashing and patch holes, as needed, per the submitted photographs.

Repair Rubber Roof

- Completely re-flash entire perimeter of flat roof with new metal and EPDM cover tape.
- Repair tears/holes in rubber roof, as needed, per the submitted photographs.
- Secure and re-seal flashing on all four existing chimneys. All chimneys to remain in place, as is.

Chemically Clean Brick/Graffiti

- Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a small area in the least visible location possible.
- Following the application of the cleaning solution, the entire treated area is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations.
- If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings," <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm>).

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

- **15-7-3**

17 East Brickel Street/Ste. E

Mulberry Build + Design, LLC (Applicant)

Mohawk Properties, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-3, 17 East Brickel Street/Ste. E, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Signage

- Install one (1) new, non-illuminated, 30" x 30", aluminum projecting sign, per the submitted rendering.
- Applied letters to include the business name "MULBERRY" and logo.
- Colors to be shades of white and gray, per the submitted rendering.
- New sign to be located to the right of the front entrance on the existing bracket.
- Existing goose neck light fixture to remain.

- **15-7-4**

812 Kerr Street

Jynel Casey (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-4, 812 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, damaged, wood privacy fence in the rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove the three (3) existing, inappropriately located, small trees that are growing into the fence line.
- Install a new six-foot high (6' H), dog-ear, wood privacy fence and two (2) gates in the same location as the existing fence, per the submitted site plan.
- New fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **15-7-5**

1069 Say Avenue

Jessica Moore & Tim Foradis (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-5, 1069 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Tree Removal

- Remove the previously storm damaged and deteriorating tree, located in the rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Tree removal to be done in accordance with standard industry practices to insure the safety of all neighboring properties and any/all workers involved.
- Remove the stump below grade to prevent new growth
- Haul away all debris.
- A new tree is to be planted within the same general area as the tree that has been removed.
- The species of the new tree to be chosen by Applicant.

- **15-7-6**

375 East Fifth Avenue

Ascent Roofing Solutions, LLC (Applicant)

Clark Grave Vault (Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-6, 375 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove all existing rubber roofing on the flat sections of the roof, down to the sheathing, Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new rubber roofing, per the submitted specifications.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Any existing tile or metal coping to be retained, or replaced in-like-kind.

- **15-7-7**

136-140 East Third Avenue & 1034 Summit Street

Italian Village Summit & Third Condominium Association (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-7, 136-140 East Third Avenue & 1034 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone/concrete) is to remain unpainted.**

Repair/Replace Siding

- Remove any existing, broken or damaged vinyl siding and replace with new vinyl siding to match existing; like-for-like.

Note: Vinyl siding was approved for this new construction in 2002 as a text case only.

- **15-7-8**

85 East First Avenue #5

Kathleen S. Lewis (Applicant)

David & Shelly Buhlman (Owner)

Approve Application 15-7-8, 85 East First Avenue #5, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Windows

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Install New Storm Windows

- Remove existing aluminum storm windows.
- Install new, low profile, metal storm windows on all windows, as needed.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) ADJOURNED (11:04 p.m.)